New Hampshire court ponders murder victim's privacy

By HOLLY RAMER AP, September 21, 2016



This undated family photo shows Elizabeth "Lizzi" Marriott. —Britney Atwood / AP

CONCORD, N.H. (AP) — The New Hampshire Supreme Court is deciding whether details of a young woman's sexual history should remain private after her rape and murder in a case that advocates say could mark the first time a state strips away key protections for victims.

Elizabeth "Lizzi" Marriott, of Westborough, Massachusetts, was a 19-year-old sophomore at the University of New Hampshire when she was killed in 2012. Seth Mazzaglia was convicted of her murder and is serving a life sentence, but on

appeal argues the trial court should have allowed him to introduce evidence about Marriott's past.

During his trial, Mazzaglia denied raping and killing Marriott but said he helped cover up the murder. His girlfriend at the time testified that she lured Marriott to Mazzaglia's apartment as a sexual offering and that Mazzaglia strangled Marriott when she refused his advances.

In June, the New Hampshire Supreme Court ruled that information about Marriott's sexual activity that had been sealed during the trial should be made public during the appeals process, prompting objections from prosecutors and Marriott's family. On Wednesday, lawyers from both sides made their case to the court.

Assistant Attorney General Peter Hinckley argued that Marriott's right to privacy outweighs the public's right to a fully open court system. He asked the court to hold oral arguments on Mazzaglia's appeal behind closed doors, and then release a transcript later with private information blacked out.

"We're in no way seeking to minimize or downplay the important public right to access, but on rare occasions that constitutional right gives way to other compelling interests. This case, we're saying, is one of those unique, rare cases in which some limited safeguards should be used," he said.

Mazzaglia's attorney argued that the court should not conduct the appellate process behind closed doors and on the basis of a secret record.

"Openness leads to accountability, and accountability leads to quality," said attorney Christopher Johnson. "The public has to be able to judge the judges."

But Justice Carol Ann Conboy noted that the court often makes decisions regarding private information. For example, in deciding whether a trial court judge should have given defense counsel access to mental health records, justices read the records and issue an opinion without making the information public.

"In that case the public has no idea what was in those records. Why isn't that an appropriate analogy?" she asked.

At issue is whether the state's rape shield law, which is intended to protect rape victims from having their personal information revealed during criminal proceedings, applies to both trials and appeals. Every state has such laws, and the New Hampshire case could effectively eviscerate them, said Lyn Schollett, executive director of the New Hampshire Coalition Against Domestic and Sexual Violence.

"If these protections are stripped away, we return to the dialogue we were having about rape victims in the 1970s," she said. "No other state in the country takes away these protections on appeal. If a victim's reputation is not protected in the trial court, fewer victims will come forward. When victims don't come forward, fewer cases are prosecuted and our public safety as a state is compromised."

TOPICS: Local News

Want to see what readers are saying about our stories?

Check out the conversations on Boston.com's Facebook Page

Tips? Corrections? Feedback? Email us at tips@boston.com



SCIENCE

Climate change threatens world's coffee supply, report says September 23, 2016 | 5:00 AM



NATIONAL NEWS

Sacramento Mayor Kevin Johnson tackles protester who hit him with pie September 22, 2016 | 10:55 PM



CRIME

Teen charged after allegedly flipping stolen Land Rover in Roxbury, critically injuring passenger September 22, 2016 | 10:02 PM



LOCAL NEWS

19-year-old dies after crash in Raynham September 22, 2016 | 9:49 PM



CRIME

Police investigating shooting inside Stoughton CVS September 22, 2016 | 8:15 PM



CRIME

Maine man who set lobster boat on fire gets 7 years September 22, 2016 | 7:10 PM



Barrel House Z's taproom is now open September 22, 2016 | 7:07 PM



LOCAL NEWS

Andover police investigating report of 'suspicious' ice cream truck driver September 22, 2016 | 6:20 PM



CRIME

Police: South Boston drug bust nets 3 arrests September 22, 2016 | 6:10 PM



NATIONAL NEWS

Tulsa police officer charged in man's death September 22, 2016 | 5:03 PM



ANIMALS

Animal rescue team captures wayward manatee off Cape Cod September 22, 2016 | 4:45 PM



ANIMALS

Dog hit by commuter rail train with severed leg looking for new September 22, 2016 | 3:37 PM



NATIONAL NEWS

Yahoo hack steals personal info from at least 500 million accounts September 22, 2016 | 3:31 PM



POLITICS

Baker says he agrees with Warren: Wells Fargo CEO should resign September 22, 2016 | 2:26 PM



LOCAL NEWS

Motorcycle rider dies in Lawrence crash September 22, 2016 | 1:58 PM



LOCAL NEWS

Man struck, killed by Amtrak train in Mansfield September 22, 2016 | 1:51 PM



NATIONAL NEWS

Charlotte chief: Family will watch police video of shooting September 22, 2016 | 12:05 PM



LOCAL NEWS

Braintree police chief to retire after evidence disappeared from department

September 22, 2016 | 10:38 AM



LOCAL NEWS

Police: Moose killed, 1 person hurt, in Westborough crash September 22, 2016 | 9:42 AM



LOCAL NEWS

Police issue arrest warrant for Quincy real estate agent September 22, 2016 | 9:08 AM



LOCAL NEWS

Founder of J. Geils Band facing drunken driving charge September 22, 2016 | 9:04 AM



LOCAL NEWS

Route 128 will be shut down for two days in November September 22, 2016 | 8:58 AM



CRIME

Massachusetts man sentenced for raping 2 teens September 22, 2016 | 7:40 AM



LOCAL NEWS

Tsarnaev prosecutor appointed first assistant US attorney September 22, 2016 | 6:05 AM



NATIONAL NEWS

Disney pulls boy's costume critics lambasted as 'Polyface' September 22, 2016 | 5:00 AM



LOCAL NEWS

Gay community's longtime haven closing its doors in Lynn September 22, 2016 | 5:00 AM



BOOKS

Jodi Picoult to kick off book tour for 'Small Great Things' in Chestnut Hill September 22, 2016 | 5:00 AM



NATIONAL NEWS

Firestorms at 2 colleges after students share racially charged photos September 22, 2016 | 5:00 AM



CRIME

3 men plead guilty to sex trafficking minor September 22, 2016 | 5:00 AM



CRIME

Rhode Island man pleads quilty in plot for Islamic State group to behead blogger September 22, 2016 | 1:04 AM

©2016 Boston Globe Media Partners, LLC Privacy Policy | Terms of Service | Ad Choices